United Nations Human Rights Council

Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

45th session

CHINA

Joint submission on the human rights situation in Tibet by



International Federation for Human Rights
17, passage de la Main d'Or
75011 Paris,
France
www.fidh.org
asia@fidh.org
and



International Campaign for Tibet 1825 Jefferson Place NW Washington D.C., 20036 United States of America www.savetibet.org info@savetibet.org

The International Campaign for Tibet (ICT) is a non-profit advocacy group working to promote democratic freedom for Tibetans, ensure their human rights, and protect the Tibetan culture and environment. ICT is member of the International Federation for Human Rights (FIDH), the governing body of the German Institute for Human Rights (DIMR), the civil society network World Heritage Watch, and the NGO-Committee on FORB (Geneva).

FIDH (International Federation for Human Rights) is an international human rights NGO federating 188 organizations from 116 countries. Since 1922, FIDH has been defending all civil, political, economic, social, and cultural rights as set out in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

Introduction

- 1. Since the third cycle of China's Universal Periodic Review (UPR) in 2018, the human rights situation in Tibet¹ has deteriorated significantly. This is relevant for both civil and political rights as well as economic, social, and cultural rights of the Tibetan people. Violations have been widespread and systematic, and policies to "sinicize" Tibetan Buddhism, Tibetan language, and Tibetan way of life constitute a fundamental threat to the survival of an authentic and self-determined Tibetan culture and associated rights.
- 2. The Chinese government intervenes in the Tibetan way of life through relocation policies, the systematic control and interference in Tibetan Buddhists' religious practices, a system of boarding schools that separate families, and the prioritization of Chinese language over Tibetan language in education. In addition, the Chinese authorities persecute any independent cultural expression not authorized and controlled by the state. As a result, Tibetan writers, intellectuals, and thought leaders are systematically harassed, detained, and sentenced to prison terms.
- 3. These developments have been acknowledged in concerns raised by United Nations (UN) treaty bodies, such as the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, and the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. Moreover, independent UN special procedures have raised concerns with regard to persecuted individuals and the policies implemented by the Chinese authorities in Tibet.
- 4. On 11 January 2020, the 11th People's Congress of the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) adopted new "Regulations to establish a model area for national unity and progress in the Tibet Autonomous Region." In effect since May 2020, the new regulations legally institute a Han-centric Chinese identity into all facets of personal, social, and professional life. The assertion of a dominant ethnic culture violates international human rights treaties, such as the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), which China ratified in 2001, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD), which China ratified in 1981, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which China ratified in 1992.
- 5. On 29 August 2020, the 7th Tibet Work Forum of the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) concluded under the leadership of Secretary General Xi Jinping, indicating the top priority being assigned to Tibet by the Chinese leadership. This important meeting reiterated policy guidelines that represent a threat to Tibetan culture and human rights. Chinese state media reported that Xi laid out a "strategy of governing Tibet in the new era," which includes "sinicization" of Tibetan Buddhism and improving the ability of CCP organizations and members at all levels "to deal with major struggles and prevent major risks." There was considerable emphasis on ensuring "national security"

- and "ethnic solidarity." Tibetan Buddhism should be guided in adapting to socialist society and should be "developed in the Chinese context," the Work Forum stated.³
- 6. Against this background, the Chinese authorities continue to limit Tibetans' rights to freedom of opinion and expression and freedom of peaceful association and of assembly. Individuals are routinely arbitrarily detained, subjected to torture, and denied due process in the criminal justice system for voicing basic concerns about social and environmental issues. Tibetans continue to peacefully resist despite intensified and preemptive policing.⁴ In addition, the CCP is systematically interfering in the exercise of the right to freedom of religion of Tibetan Buddhists.

Issues of concern

Forced relocation and resettlement programs

- 7. Since the 1980s, Tibetans have undergone an unprecedented process of forced or coerced relocation and resettlement. Resettlement has occurred under the policies of "ecological migration" [shengtai yimin in Chinese], "converting pastures to grasslands" [tuimu huancao] and the "comfortable housing project," which has seen the mass relocation and transfer of Tibetans to so-called "small wellbeing" [xiaokang] accommodation. In 2018, the Chinese authorities have started resettling Tibetans in accordance with the "very high-altitude relocation" program. Targets of these policies are nomads and herders and farmers and Tibetans living in rural areas of Tibet.
- 8. According to Chinese government media sources, indicating resettlement data beginning in 2001, at least 1.8 million nomads have been resettled into sedentary houses under various Chinese government policies. ⁵ This is likely an extremely conservative estimate. In 2013, Human Rights Watch reported that since 1996, when the Chinese government launched the campaign "Build a New Socialist Countryside" in Tibetan areas, over two million Tibetans (two thirds of the entire population of the TAR) had been rehoused and hundreds of thousands of nomadic herders had been transferred to "New Socialist Villages." ⁶ In areas of relocation, displaced Tibetans have not received compensation or assurances of income or employment for the future. ⁷
- 9. The planning and implementation of Chinese policies aimed at protecting the environment or mitigating climate change do not respect both the rights and the role of Tibetans. For example, Article 26 of the regulations on Nature Reserves⁸ imposes a ban on grazing and the gathering of medicinal herbs, but fails to specify processes for access to alternative grasslands for Tibetan nomads and herders. At the end of 2020, in the TAR alone, there were 47 nature reserves.⁹ By 2022, the government of the TAR announced that half of its land area were designated ecological protection zones.¹⁰
- 10. In June 2022, Chinese state media reported that 17,555 people would be relocated from Tsonyi (Shuanghu in Chinese) County, Nagchu Prefecture, to Sinburi Village,

- Gongkar County, Lhoka Prefecture in southern Tibet, by the end of August 2022. This is part of a larger plan to displace 130,000 Tibetans by 2025 under the "very highaltitude relocation program." No independent information about the number of people who were actually displaced is available.
- 11. While the Chinese government argues it achieved 100% voluntary relocations, independent research conducted from 2019 to 2022 with 93 pastoralists either resettled or due to be resettled to Nagchu Prefecture (a core target of the resettlement policy) found that families were coerced into resettling through the withdrawal of government services, dedicated communal and individual "thought work" as a means to indoctrinate, the offer of financial incentives, and threats of punishment. Research documented that consent was compelled by closing local schools and sending children to schools in the resettlement sites, repeatedly visiting and threatening families refusing to resettle, and offering financial rewards in the new settlement. Similar processes of forced consent have been reported in Shigatse, Ngari, and Lhoka Prefectures.
- 12. One pastoralist, who agreed to "voluntarily" resettle after undergoing three stages of communal and individual "thought work" describes the nature of his consent: "[...] with my signature on the agreement, officials would say I agreed to resettle. That is both true and untrue. True, because I did agree to sign. Untrue, because I would have preferred not to sign if I could refuse. [...] Officials would not leave me alone until I signed [...]."13
- 13. In addition to alarm about losing connection to their land and personal dignity, pastoralists also raised fears about securing new livelihoods. More than one-third of the 93 pastoralists interviewed for the above-reference research expressed concerns about the ability to pay their share of the resettlement house cost, equivalent to at least half of the average annual per capita income in Nagchu and potentially rising to many times that amount, depending on household size.

Harmful boarding schools' system

- 14. The Chinese government has implemented a boarding school system that separates Tibetan children from their families and enforces Chinese language education. This attack on the root of Tibetan society leaves parents in fear that their language, culture, religion, and identity will be rapidly erased. Recent reports by the Tibet Action Institute¹⁴ and the International Campaign for Tibet¹⁵ revealed China's vast network of boarding schools for students from the age of four years across Tibet and beyond. Across Tibet, at least 800,000 Tibetan children aged six to 18 are living in such schools, making up 75% of Tibetan students in this age group. At least another 100,000 children aged four to six live in pre-school boarding schools.¹⁶
- 15. Students live separated from their families, potentially facing psychological and emotional harm. Children are subjected to highly politicized education in Chinese

language. As a result, Tibetan students become strangers to their families and communities, and subsequently their culture. Parents who withhold children from these schools are blacklisted by the authorities and punished economically, for example by denying them state subsidies.

Coercive labor programs and labor transfer

16. China's forced relocation policies have also contributed to Tibetans being subjected to coercive labor programs. Recent research indicates that these programs entail military-style political indoctrination and training and assignment to workplaces, most likely not voluntarily, and under unclear remuneration schemes. In 2019 and 2020, the TAR introduced the "2019-2020 Farmer and Pastoralist Training and Labor Transfer Action Plan," which includes measures for the training and transfer of "rural surplus laborers" to certain parts of the TAR and China. According to independent research, China's labor transfer policy mandates that pastoralists and farmers are to be subjected to centralized military-style vocational training, which aims to reform "backward thinking" and includes training in "work discipline," law, and the Chinese language, 19 revealing a discriminatory perception and widespread social stigma towards Tibetans.

Freedom of religion repressed

- 17. The Chinese government continued carrying out its 2019-2023 five-year plan to co-opt Buddhism in China by emphasizing loyalty to the CCP and the state.²⁰ Operating under the control of the state-run Buddhist Association of China, the plan includes Tibetan Buddhism. The CCP's "Administrative Measures for Religious Organizations," promulgated in 2020, further formalized administrative procedures for "sinicizing" all religions, including those where Tibetan Buddhism is practiced, to "follow the path of socialism with Chinese characteristics."
- 18. The CCP's efforts to interfere in the reincarnation process of Tibetan spiritual leaders in and outside Tibet is an egregious violation of Tibetan Buddhists' right to religious freedom. It threatens to cause enormous upheaval when the CCP disregards the Tibetan Buddhist leaders' process for determining the current 14th Dalai Lama's reincarnation and anoints its own handpicked successor as the 15th Dalai Lama. There is a disturbing precedent for this profoundly politicized human rights violation. In 1995, Chinese authorities kidnapped and disappeared a six-year-old boy, Gedhun Choekyi Nyima, and his family, just three days after the present Dalai Lama recognized him as the reincarnation of the 11th Panchen Lama. Shortly thereafter, Beijing installed its own Panchen Lama, Gyaltsen Norbu. Gedhun Choekyi Nyima and his family have not been seen since 1995 and no assurance has been provided that they are still alive.²¹ UN special procedures and treaty bodies have consistently raised the case of the Panchen Lama with the Chinese government and have urged the Chinese government

- to respect the religious rights of Tibetan Buddhists to appoint their clergy without interference of the government.
- 19. Over the years, the Chinese state has promulgated various regulations to bring Tibetan monasteries and monastics under tighter control of the state, including in relation to the management of financial affairs of monasteries and through new behavioral controls and surveillance requirements. Controls on Tibetan Buddhist monasteries looked set to tighten with the enforcement of China's "Measures for the Financial Management of Religious Activity Sites," which came into effect on 1 June 2022. This legal instrument to control the finances of religious activity sites replaced the "Measures on the Supervision and Management of Financial Affairs for Religious Activities" promulgated in 2010. The measures enacted in June 2022 followed the coming into force of the "Measures on the Administration of Internet Religious Information Service" in March 2022. The March 2022 measures prohibit foreign organizations and individuals from spreading "religious content" online in China or Tibet, with religious groups inside China required to obtain a special license to do so.²²

Tibetan language disappearing

- 20. In Tibet, Mandarin (*Putonghua*) is rapidly replacing Tibetan as the language of education. China has promoted its so-called "sinicization" agenda under the pretense of "national unity" by using terms such as "bilingual education," "mixed classes," "concentrated schooling," and "ethnic mingling."
- 21. Since the 1990s, there has been a clear shift from Tibetan-medium education to Mandarin. The National Long-Term Education Reform and Development Plan (2010-2020) and the Thirteenth Five-Year Development Plan for National Language Works (2016-2020) promoted the use of written and spoken Mandarin as the official national language of China. He language and culture of the Han majority are inculcated daily at boarding schools. As a result, language and cultural proficiency wanes and many Tibetan students lose their ability to read and write in their mother tongue. Chinese authorities claim that in Tibet primary schools are given the choice of whether to teach in Tibetan or Mandarin. However, evidence reveals that schools are pressured into using Mandarin as a medium of education. Independent research found that in June 2016 the Lhasa Education Bureau announced that Mandarin was being used as the medium of instruction in a majority of primary schools in the counties around Lhasa, including rural areas outside the region's capital city.
- 22. By 2007, 95% of all TAR primary schools employed Mandarin as the medium of education. ²⁷ This reflected the Chinese government's lack of commitment to implementing language rights and its failure to fund and support Tibetan bilingual teacher training and Tibetan language learning resources, all of which researchers in the field have consistently lamented. ²⁸ This issue is especially problematic for secondary and tertiary schooling, where textbooks are translated into classical Tibetan

instead of the local dialects, and also fail to include culturally and geographically relevant material, which consequently fails to stimulate student interest in learning.²⁹ The sum of these factors has ended Tibetan-language instruction in secondary schooling and accelerated the substitution of Mandarin as a medium of education.

Arbitrary detention, torture, and ill-treatment

- 23. In 2022, the International Campaign for Tibet published a report analyzing information regarding 50 cases of known Tibetan environmental defenders persecuted by the Chinese government since 2008.³⁰ The report outlined a pattern adopted by the Chinese authorities according to which Tibetans who advocate for the protection of the environment and for social and development related issues are subjected to harassment, torture, ill-treatment, and criminal persecution.
- 24. Recent examples of such pattern of persecution abound. Anya Sengdra is a nomad and community leader from Gade (Gande in Chinese) County, Golog (Guoluo) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Qinghai Province. He is an environmental activist who has peacefully campaigned against alleged corruption, illegal mining activities, and the illegal hunting and poaching of endangered animals in Tibet. On 4 September 2018, Sengdra was arrested for his activist work at the age of 47. On 6 December 2019, the Gade County Court sentenced him to seven years imprisonment on charges of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble" and "gathering people to disturb public order" under Articles 290 and 293 of China's Criminal Law respectively. On 17 June 2020, Sengdra's appeal against his conviction and prison sentence was rejected.³¹
- 25. On 26 October 2020, Go Sherab Gyatso, a Tibetan-Buddhist scholar, writer, and advocate of Tibet's religious and cultural traditions, was subjected to enforced disappearance and arbitrary detention. Over a year later, in November 2021, he was sentenced to 10 years in prison in a closed-door trial.³² Many details of Gyatso's case remain unknown, including his charge and the evidence used against him. After a July 2021 communication by four UN special procedures, ³³ the Chinese government acknowledged that Go Sherab Gyatso was arrested on suspicion of "inciting secession," but did not specify in what criminal activities he had allegedly engaged.³⁴ Gyatso's arbitrary arrest, incommunicado detention, closed-door trial, and 10-year prison sentence for the peaceful expression of his opinions reflect China's pattern of persecuting dissent and independent thought in Tibet.
- 26. In November 2020, Buddhist monk Rinchen Tsultrim was sentenced to four years and six months in prison on charges of "inciting secession." Chinese authorities claim that he had posted messages on the Chinese social media app WeChat that "endangered national unity, sovereignty, and territorial integrity and undermined social stability."³⁵
- 27. In September 2022, Chinese authorities in Kardze (Ganzi in Chinese) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture sentenced six notable Tibetan writers and former political prisoners, Gangkye Drubpa Kyab, Tsering Dolma, Samdup, Gangbu Yudrum, Seynam,

- and Pema Rinchen, to prison terms ranging from four to 14 years on charges of "inciting separatism" and "endangering state security." ³⁶
- 28. Tibetan political prisoners are routinely tortured and mistreated, often resulting in their death not long after their release. On 6 February 2021, Kunchok Jinpa, 51, died in a hospital in Lhasa less than three months after being released from prison. Throughout his detention, there had been no information on his whereabouts since his arrest in November 2013.³⁷ In January 2021, 19-year-old Tenzin Nyima died soon after being released from police custody. Authorities initially detained him on 9 November 2019, two days after he and three other monks from a local monastery in Wonpo, Kardze (Ganzi in Chinese) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Sichuan Province, briefly distributed leaflets and shouted slogans calling for Tibetan independence outside the local Wonpo government office. The protests occurred as local officials increasingly put pressure on forcibly resettled nomads and local residents to publicly praise the government's poverty alleviation program.³⁸
- 29. In August 2020, Lhamo, a 36-year-old herder and mother of three, died after mistreatment in detention, apparently in connection to her cousin's advocacy for the protection of the Tibetan language. Her cousin was also detained.³⁹
- 30. There is also grave concern about the imprisoned Tibetan businessman and philanthropist Dorjee Tashi, who detailed severe torture to which he had been subjected in a testimony made public. Tashi, considered one of the wealthiest people in Tibet, received a life sentence in 2010 in the wake of the Chinese government's crackdown on mass Tibetan protests in the spring of 2008. He is currently serving his prison term in the notorious TAR Prison No 1, colloquially known as Drapchi Prison, where Tibetan prisoners are known to be tortured during their incarceration. Tashi Dorjee was a successful businessman who owned a luxury hotel chain and real estate companies in Tibet when he was arrested in July 2008. He was framed as a "secessionist" by political and CCP leaders, apparently taking advantage of the political situation in the wake of the mass Tibetan protests. While political charges were later dropped, on 17 May 2010 he was declared guilty of "loan fraud" and sentenced to life imprisonment by the Lhasa Intermediate People's Court. On 26 July 2010, the TAR People's Higher Court upheld the Lhasa Intermediate People's Court's verdict. Dorjee was then 36 years old.⁴⁰
- 31. On 15 February 2022, the popular Tibetan singer Tsewang Norbu (Caiwang Luobu in Chinese), described by *The Economist* as "the Chinese government's ideal minority youth," set himself on fire in front of the Potala Palace in Lhasa, most likely in protest against CCP policies in Tibet. He later died in hospital of his injuries. As a result of strict information controls and increased security personnel across Lhasa, reports of Norbu's self-immolation only reached the international community a week later, while his death was not confirmed until 18 days later. 42

Lack of access to Tibet and cooperation with UN mechanisms

- 32. Tibet is one of the least accessible regions in the world for foreign visitors, including diplomats, journalists, and independent observers.⁴³ Its complete isolation is part of the Chinese government's strategy to oppress the Tibetan people by denying international scrutiny of the CCP's violations of basic human rights.
- 33. The TAR is the only region for which Chinese authorities require foreigners, including foreign media, to have special permission to enter. According to a report by the Foreign Correspondents' Club of China, all three foreign journalists who applied for permission to enter the TAR in 2022 had their request rejected.⁴⁴
- 34. Mary Robinson was the last UN High Commissioner for Human Rights who was able to visit Tibet in September 1998.⁴⁵ The last UN special procedures' mandate holder who was able to undertake an official fact-finding mission to Tibet was Manfred Nowak then Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in 2005.⁴⁶

Recommendations to the government of China

Relocation and resettlement programs

- Halt coercive relocation and resettlement policies in Tibet, and allow for the principles
 of Free, Prior, and Informed Consent to be applied, in line with the United Nations
 Sustainable Development Goals.
- Respect the principles of equal treatment, community participation, information transparency, freedom of speech, and fair treatment of local communities with regard to the planning and implementation of environmental policies.
- Provide access to justice via an independent judiciary for individuals subjected to relocation programs.
- Provide detailed information on cases of redress, remedy, and compensation sought by affected Tibetans, including those rejected or granted by the authorities.

Labor transfer programs

- Halt and review labor transfer and training schemes in the Tibet Autonomous Region.
- Make information on the design and implementation of labor transfer and training schemes in the Tibet Autonomous Region and other Tibetan regions publicly available and include provisions that allow Tibetans to opt out.
- Provide access to justice via an independent judiciary for individuals subjected to labor transfer and training schemes in the Tibet Autonomous Region.

Boarding schools

- Immediately abolish the boarding school and pre-school system imposed on Tibetan children and authorize and subsidize the establishment of private Tibetan schools.
- Revise the "bilingual education" policy that replaces Tibetan with Mandarin as the medium of education, ensure that all Tibetan children are able to use Tibetan in every aspect of their schooling, and reverse the closure of schools providing education in the Tibetan language.
- Halt indoctrination, based on political ideology and disregard for child rights at all levels of the school curricula and ensure that Tibetan students are permitted to learn about their own history, culture, and religion.

Religious freedom and language

- End policies of "sinicization" that eradicate core tenets of Tibetan culture, such as language, religious beliefs, and ways of life.
- Recognize, respect, and protect Tibetan culture and the right of Tibetans to practice
 their traditions, customs, religious beliefs, language, and other manifestations of their
 cultural identity, free from state intervention, in accordance with international law.
- End the persecution of Tibetans exercising their right to freedom of religion or belief, and end intervention into the appointment of Tibetan Buddhist clergy.
- Release information on the whereabouts of the 11th Panchen Lama Gedhun Choekyi Nyima, grant independent access to him, and allow him to exercise his right to freedom of movement.
- End policies that uproot the use of Tibetan language, re-introduce Tibetan language as a medium of education in schools, and allow for privately run Tibetan language schools, particularly in Tibetan Buddhist monasteries.

Arbitrary detention, torture, and ill-treatment in Tibet

- Immediately ratify the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and ensure that its provisions are applicable to the Tibet Autonomous Region.
- Effectively address threats, attacks, harassment, and intimidation against Tibetan human rights defenders, including by thoroughly, promptly, and independently investigating human rights violations and abuses against them, bringing the perpetrators to justice in fair trials, and providing effective remedies and adequate reparation to the victims.
- End the persecution of independent cultural expression and release all those detained for peacefully exercising their right to freedom of thought and expression, including the Tibetans Go Sherab Gyatso, Anya Sengdra, Rinchen Tsultrim, and Dorjee Tashi.

• Urgently release all those Tibetans who have documented the consequences of land use policies, mining, damming. or poaching, and advocated for redress.

Access to Tibet and cooperation with UN mechanisms

 Allow immediate and unfettered access to Tibet for journalists and independent observers, including the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and UN special procedures' mandate holders.

Sino-Tibetan dialogue

Resume the dialogue with representatives of the Dalai Lama without preconditions
with a view to implement a mutually beneficial and lasting resolution to the SinoTibetan conflict that allows the Tibetan people to protect their culture and preserve
their identity.

¹ Tibet was traditionally comprised of three main areas: Amdo (north-eastern Tibet), Kham (eastern Tibet) and U-Tsang (central and western Tibet). The Tibet Autonomous Region was set up by the Chinese government in 1965 and covers the area of Tibet west of the Dri-chu (Yangtse River), including part of Kham. The rest of Amdo and Kham have been incorporated into Chinese provinces, and where Tibetan communities were said to have "compact inhabitancy" in these provinces, they were designated Tibetan Autonomous Prefectures and counties. As a result, most of Qinghai Province and parts of Gansu, Sichuan, and Yunnan Provinces are acknowledged by the Chinese government to be "Tibetan." This submission uses the term "Tibet" to refer to all Tibetan areas designated as "autonomous" by the Chinese government.
² China Tibet News, Regulations on the establishment of a model area for ethnic unity and progress in the Tibet Autonomous Region, 15 January 2020 [in Chinese]; http://epaper.chinatibetnews.com/xzrb/202001/15/content_10887.html
³ International Campaign for Tibet, Tibet's importance seen at major meeting promising more repression, 1 September 2020; https://savetibet.org/tibets-importance-seen-at-major-meeting-promising-more-repression/

⁴ Since 2009, at least 159 Tibetans have committed self-immolation to protest against Chinese repressive policies, the lack of fundamental freedoms and to ask for the return of the Dalai Lama to Tibet. See https://savetibet.org/tibetan-self-immolations/

⁵ Human Rights Watch, *They Say We Should Be Grateful" Mass Rehousing and Relocation Programs in Tibetan Areas of China*, 4 June 2013; https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/tibet0613webwcover_0.pdf; CGTN, *Tibet: How China's toughest battleground defeated absolute poverty?*, 16 October 2020; https://news.cgtn.com/news/2020-10-16/How-Tibet-eliminated-absolute-poverty-despite-harsh-climate--UDkSdO4J55/index.html; Xinhua, *Massive nomad settlement to protect "mother river"*, 1 December 2012; http://en.people.cn/90882/8041990.html; China Daily, *Over 1 million Tibetan nomads choose settlement*, 6 July 2012; http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2012-07/06/content_15555645.htm; China Daily, *Families moving into the modern era*, 7 August 2015, http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/tibet50years/2015-08/07/content_21525294.htm

⁶ Human Rights Watch, *They Say We Should Be Grateful" Mass Rehousing and Relocation Programs in Tibetan Areas of China*, 4 June 2013; https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/tibet0613webwcover_0.pdf; CGTN

⁷ Ihid

⁸ Regulations of the People's Republic of China on nature reserves, in FAOLEX, https://www.fao.org/faolex/results/details/en/c/LEX-FAOC011954/

⁹ Xinhua, *Across China: Tibet protects natural areas, improves biodiversity,* 14 October 2020; http://www.news.cn/english/2021-10/14/c 1310244131.htm

¹⁰ State Council of the People's Republic of China, *Half of Tibet set as ecological protection zone*, 12 October 2022; http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202210/12/content_WS6346005cc6d0a757729e118c.html

¹¹ International Campaign for Tibet, *Mass relocations continue: 17,000 Tibetans leave homes by August*, 5 July 2022; https://savetibet.org/mass-relocations-continue-17000-tibetans-to-leave-homes-by-august/

¹² Nyima, Y., & Yeh, E., *The Construction of Consent for High-altitude Resettlement in Tibet. The China Quarterly*, 2023; pages 254 and 429-447.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Tibet Action Institute, Separated from their families, hidden from the world - China's Vast System of Colonial Boarding Schools Inside Tibet, December 2021; https://s7712.pcdn.co/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/2021 ColonialBoardingSchoolReport Digital.pdf

```
<sup>15</sup> International Campaign for Tibet, Tibetans sent to mainland Chinese schools under guise of "progress", 12 January 2021; https://savetibet.org/tibetans-sent-to-mainland-chinese-schools-under-guise-of-progress/
```

- ¹⁷ Adrian Zenz, *Xinjiang's System of Militarized Vocational Training Comes to Tibet*, 22 September 2020; in China Brief 2020, Volume: 20, issue: 17.
- ¹⁸ *Ibid*.
- 19 Ibid.
- ²⁰ Buddhist Association of China, *Outline of the Five-Year work plan for adhering to the Sinicisation of Buddhism* [2019-2023], 14 November 2019 [in Chinese]; http://www.chinabuddhism.com.cn/e/action/ShowInfo.php?classid=506&id=40672
- ²¹ International Campaign for Tibet, *UN experts write to China on Panchen Lama, reincarnation rules,* 4 August 2020; https://savetibet.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/08042020-UN.pdf; *Full text of communication from five UN experts (Special Procedures) to the Chinese government about the ongoing enforced disappearance of the Panchen Lama,* 2 June 2020; https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownLoadPublicCommunicationFile?gld=25294
- ²² International Campaign for Tibet, *Tibetan monasteries face tighter control under new religious financial management measures*, 1 June 2022; https://savetibet.org/tibetan-monasteries-face-tighter-control-under-new-religious-financial-management-measures/
- ²³ Human Rights Watch, *China: Tibetan Children Denied Mother-Tongue Classes, 'Bilingual' Policy Threatens Tibetan-Medium Education*, 5 March 2020; https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/03/05/china-tibetan-children-denied-mother-tongue-classes
 ²⁴ *Ihid*
- ²⁵ Ibid.
- ²⁶ Ibid.
- ²⁷ 2007 Research report by the TAR Bilingual Education Commission cited in Ma Rong, *The Process of Bilingual Education Development in the TAR since 1951*, 2013; in Minority Education in China: Balancing Unity and Diversity in an Era of Critical Pluralism 101 (James Leibold & Yangbin Chen eds.), 2013.
- ²⁸ Lubei Zhang and Linda T.H. Tsung, *Tibetan bilingual education in Qinghai: government policy vs family language pr*actice, (2019); §, 22 Int'l J. of Bilingual Educ. and Bilingualism, page 299.
- ²⁹ Eirini Gouleta, *A bilingual education professional development project for primary Tibetan teachers in China: the experience and lessons learned*, Int'l J. of Bilingual Educ. and Bilingualism, 6, 2011.
- ³⁰ International Campaign for Tibet, *Environmental defenders of Tibet*, June 2022; https://savetibet.de/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/2205-ICFT-Report_V8.pdf
- ³¹ International Campaign for Tibet, *Court rejects appeal of Tibetan anti-corruption campaigner*; 18 June 2020; https://savetibet.org/court-rejects-appeal-oftibetan-anti-corruption-campaigner/
- ³² Radio Free Asia, *Tibetan writer given 10-year prison term in secret trial*, 10 December 2021; https://www.rfa.org/english/news/tibet/trial-12102021135859.html; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, https://tchrd.org/eminent-tibetan-scholar-go-sherab-gyatso-sentenced-to-ten-years-in-prison/
- ³³ OHCHR, *AL CHN 7/2021*; 16 July 2021;

https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownLoadPublicCommunicationFile?gld=26506

³⁴ Permanent Mission of the People's Republic of China (No.GJ/43/2021), Reply from China dated 27 August 2021 to OHCHR joint communication [AL CHN 7/2021] of 16 July 2021, 27 August 2021;

https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownLoadFile?gld=36528

35 OHCHR, AL CHN 7/2021, 16 July 2021;

https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownLoadPublicCommunicationFile?gld=26506

³⁶ International Campaign for Tibet, *6 Tibetan writers and former political prisoners sentenced to 4 to 14 years*, 20 October 2022; https://savetibet.org/6-tibetan-writers-and-former-political-prisoners-sentenced-to-4-to-14-years/

³⁷ Human Rights Watch, *China: Tibetan Tour Guide Dies from Prison Injuries*, 16 February 2021;

https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/02/16/china-tibetan-tour-guide-dies-prison-injuries

- ³⁸ International Campaign for Tibet, *Tibetan monk dies after beating in custody: pattern of torture and mistreatment in Tibet must end*, 22 January 2021; https://savetibet.org/tibetan-monk-dies-after-beating-in-custody-pattern-of-torture-and-mistreatment-in-tibet-must-end/
- ³⁹ Radio Free Asia, *Tibetan Woman Dies After Being Tortured in Chinese Custody*, 29 October 2020, https://www.rfa.org/english/news/tibet/torture-10292020201523.html
- ⁴⁰ International Campaign for Tibet, *Testimony reveals pre-trial torture of Tibetan businessman-philanthropist*, 16 August 2021; https://savetibet.org/testimony-reveals-pre-trial-torture-of-tibetan-businessman-philanthropist/
- ⁴¹ Economist, Deciphering a Tibetan star's self-immolation, 2 April 2022;

https://www.economist.com/china/2022/04/02/deciphering-a-tibetan-pop-stars-self-immolation

- ⁴² International Campaign for Tibet, *Tibetan singer Tsewang Norbu confirmed dead due to extreme burn*, 15 March 2022; https://savetibet.org/tibetan-singer-tsewang-norbu-confirmed-dead-due-to-extreme-burn/
- ⁴³ International Campaign for Tibet, *Access denied: China's enforced isolation of Tibet, and the case for reciprocity*, May 2018; https://savetibet.org/access-denied-chinas-enforced-isolation-of-tibet-and-the-case-for-reciprocity/

¹⁶ New York Times, *One Nation Under Xi: How China's Leader Is Remaking Its Identity*, 11 October 2022; https://www.nytimes.com/2022/10/11/world/asia/xi-jinping-china-nationhood.html

⁴⁴ Foreign Correspondents' Club of China, *Report on Media freedom in 2022 - Zero Covid, Many Controls: Covering China in 2022*; https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UhSRnauuTslkFEG1mW2F4L2zMFV2m88u/view

⁴⁵ OHCHR, *High Commissioner for Human Rights to visit China from 7 to 15 September 1998*, 4 September 1998; https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2009/10/high-commissioner-human-rights-visit-china-7-15-september-1998 ⁴⁶ OHCHR, *Special Rapporteur on torture highlights challenges at end of visit to China*, 2 December 2005; https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2009/10/special-rapporteur-torture-highlights-challenges-end-visit-china